

Preserving Cultural Heritage

Membership Designation Working Group (MDWG) Rubric Proposal

May 2021

Background Information/Context

The Membership Designation Working Group (MDWG) formed the Rubric Subgroup at the beginning of 2020. The subgroup was tasked with developing criteria (rubrics) to evaluate Professional Member applications.

Based on the newly revised twelve <u>Essential Competencies</u>, the rubrics are designed to provide clarity and transparency for applicants, sponsors, and evaluators (Membership Committee) to ensure that all are working from the same point of reference. The rubrics provide examples of work/projects that applicants can use for their narratives to demonstrate that they have met the Essential Competencies. Sponsors can use the rubrics to ensure that members they are sponsoring satisfy the application requirements. Finally, the rubrics will be used by evaluators to assess an applicant's knowledge of the Essential Competencies.

The MDWG Rubrics Subgroup is composed of a selection of AIC members who either responded to an open membership call for volunteers, or were asked to join based on their existing positions within AIC or area of practice. The intention was that the Rubric Subgroup would represent the breadth of specializations of AIC members; length of time in the field; types of training; and reflect a range of workplaces: cultural institutions, private practices, and academia. Three members of the MDWG committee serve on the Rubrics Subgroup in order to provide background information and to relay broader discussions about rubrics to/from the MDWG. Two members of the Education and Training Committee (ETC) are members of the subgroup, to provide background knowledge regarding long-term education for professionals.

Rubrics Subgroup Members

Colleen O'Shea, co-chair /ETC (Assistant Objects Conservator, Fine Arts Museums of San Francisco) Deborah Trupin, co-chair/MDWG (Textile/upholstery conservator, Trupin Conservation Services) Dawn Rogala, ETC (Conservator and Program Manager, Smithsonian's Museum Conservation Institute) Stephanie Lussier, MDWG (Paper and Photographs Conservator, Hirshhorn Museum and Sculpture Garden) Catherine Matsen, MDWG (Scientist, Winterthur Museum) Lizzie Curran (Assistant Conservator, Dartmouth College Library) Andrew Fearon (Chief Architectural Conservator, Materials Conservation) Becky Fifield (Head, Collection Management, New York Public Library) Catharine Hawks (Museum Conservator, National Museum of Natural History) Jamye Jamison (Paper Conservator, Jamison Art Conservation) Kate Lewis (Chief Conservator, Museum of Modern Art) Catherine H. Stephens (Associate Research Scientist, Metropolitan Museum of Art)

AIC ESSENTIAL COMPETENCIES



TABLES: RUBRICS FOR EVALUATION OF PROFESSIONAL MEMBERSHIP APPLICATIONS

The tables of rubrics that follow are organized according to the three different categories outlined in the Professional Member Essential Competencies document (Section 1: Purpose and Scope): Conservation, Preservation, and Scientific Analysis. The rubrics give *examples* of ways in which an applicant can show their knowledge of a particular competency. The examples provided are *not* considered an exhaustive list; they are simply meant as suggestions for both the applicant and evaluator of ways in which the competency may be demonstrated. The applicant's narrative and accompanying three to five project submissions must collectively demonstrate the understanding of all competencies.

RUBRICS — FOUNDATION COMPETENCIES

COMPETENCY			
Access and Use of Cultural Heritage Understanding issues arising from the ways that cultural heritage will be accessed or used, balancing stakeholders' needs with risks to the works, sites, or users.	AIC Professional Members facilitate access to cultural heritage by ensuring safe practices and providing recommendations for or acknowledge limitations of culturally appropriate treatment, protection, and future care. Principles of diversity, equity, access, and inclusion should be foremost when formulating recommendations.		
RUBRIC	AA	ALL PROFESSIONAL MEMBERS	5
Applicant's submissions demonstrate or include some of the following:	 Collaborations with allied professionals in decision making for care and display of cultural heritage Outreach and community engagement projects to promote proper access, care and use of cultural heritage Consultations with stakeholders/communities for whom the cultural heritage has significance to ensure needed access Understanding of loan policies and processes, and risk assessments associated with display, lending, packing and transportation of cultural heritage Design and/or implementation of protection measures that ensure the safe access and use of cultural heritage. Making documentation, research data, results and findings available 		
	CONSERVATION	PRESERVATION	SCIENTIFIC ANALYSIS
	 Assessments that inform and guide the proper handling and display of cultural heritage Creation of heritage site management policies Pursuing alternate access strategies (e.g. facsimile, reformatting, digitization, emulation) where required by hazard or fragility, through collaboration with 	 Creation of heritage site management policies Risk mitigation for projects involving collections Managing risk for exhibitions and outgoing loans: legal compliance, permitting, documentation, insurance, and security Pursuing alternate access strategies (e.g. facsimile, reformatting, digitization) where required by hazard or 	 Materials analysis for risk assessment Materials analysis for creation of facsimiles, digital recreations, etc. Other

relevant allied professionals ❑ Other	fragility, through collaboration with relevant allied professionals	
	□ Other	

COMPETENCY		PROFESSIONAL MEMBER			
Cultural Heritage Stewardship History and Theory Understanding the development of historic conservation methods and practices and contemporary approaches, along with the philosophies underlying them, within one's area(s) of expertise.	AIC Professional Members make decisions guided by the knowledge of how and why current practices have evolved. This knowledge provides a foundation for professionals to continue to adapt, grow, and innovate to meet emerging needs in cultural heritage preservation.				
RUBRIC		ALL PROFESSIONAL MEMBERS	S		
Applicant's submissions demonstrate or include some of the following:	 Understanding of concepts described in foundational texts Awareness of international cultural heritage stewardship documents Awareness of newer thinking and methodologies Awareness of past methodologies Knowledge of historic events that contributed to the emergence of professional preservation and preventive conservation practices Knowledge of historical source material for conservation practice and how to find such materials Familiarity with conservation-related publications Familiarity with how allied organizations intersect with conservation goals References to existing doctrines, essays, sources on conservation methodology interpretation of non-conservators' expertise and contributions to preservation and conservation theory 				
	CONSERVATION PRESERVATION SCIENTIFIC ANALYSIS				
	 ❑ Ability to identify specific treatment methodologies within one's area of expertise, explain how they ❑ Ability to identify, research, and guide situations where repatriation or cultural care plans may apply ❑ Ability to identify, research, and guide situations where repatriation or cultural care plans may apply 				

came to be, and why they may or may not be used Other	D Other	 to a changed or improved understanding of materials and their interactions Recognition that non-original treatment materials may differ depending on the time period of (previous) treatment Familiarity with the history, advantages, and limitations of applications of scientific methods to given cultural
		 methods to given cultural heritage problems Other

COMPETENCY	
Cultural Heritage Technological History Understanding the properties and compositions of materials; knowing how materials are acquired, modified, and constructed; and knowing how these technologies changed over time.	AIC Professional Members use knowledge of the attributes and construction of cultural heritage to determine scientific, collection care, and conservation approaches. This includes the ability to identify the intrinsic properties of the materials that constitute a work, how materials are fit together, how they function structurally, and their history.
RUBRIC	ALL PROFESSIONAL MEMBERS
Applicant's submissions demonstrate or include some of the following:	 Knowledge of resources and publications for researching the history of materials and methods of manufacture Understanding risks to specific materials due to their composition, construction, or previous treatment AND/OR FROM APPROPRIATE COLUMN BELOW, AS APPLICABLE:

CONSERVATION	PRESERVATION	SCIENTIFIC ANALYSIS
 Recognition of the impact of previous conservation campaigns, including conservation materials, that are now part of cultural heritage and original materials altered by previous interventions Demonstration of the thought process used to choose materials and methods to treat cultural heritage Other 	 Understanding how methods of manufacture of cultural heritage inform collection-level and institutional-level planning Other 	 Identification of previous conservation and/or restoration campaigns, including non-original materials, that are now part of cultural heritage and original materials altered by previous interventions Projects and studies that involved materials analysis Expertise in an analytical technique or development of a technique that aids in understanding the time of manufacture or construction of cultural heritage Other

COMPETENCY	
Cultural Heritage Values and Significance Understanding of and sensitivity to the significance and values of cultural heritage in formulating preservation and conservation plans, treatments, analyses, testing, and research.	AIC Professional Members employ this understanding when formulating preservation and conservation plans, and in vetting and reviewing conservation treatment proposals, plans for analyses, testing, and research. Conservation and preservation activities are carried out with cultural sensitivity and an understanding that cultural context (values/guidelines) will guide decisions.
RUBRIC	ALL PROFESSIONAL MEMBERS
Applicant's submissions demonstrate or include some of the following:	 Evidence of collaborating with stakeholders and other professionals to uphold the value and significance of cultural heritage Evidence of choosing less interventive approaches when possible Demonstration of thought process for choosing approaches and methods for preserving cultural heritage depending on context and history

AND/OR FROM A	PPROPRIATE COLUMN BELOW	, AS APPLICABLE:
CONSERVATION	PRESERVATION	SCIENTIFIC ANALYSIS
 Knowledge of when it is/is not appropriate to treat cultural heritage given its significance Other 	 Policy development or application that demonstrates coordinating preservation with types of cultural heritage for its intended use, in accordance with laws and duty of care Other 	 Developing and/or using non-invasive and minimally- invasive techniques to analyze cultural heritage Other

COMPETENCY			
Documentation Proficiency in current standards and emerging methods of documentation, and in the preservation of that information.	AIC Professional Members creat prior use, previous interventions, examination, treatment, analysis care.	e and use information docume proposed treatment, treatmer , and collections and site care	enting cultural heritage conditions, nt, and ongoing care. Records of inform interpretation, use, and future
RUBRIC		ALL PROFESSIONAL MEMB	ERS
Applicant's submissions demonstrate or include some of the following:	 Reports and/or publications—including all forms of written, visual, imaging, or oral documentation—according to best practices Proficiency in planning, creating, and managing project documentation Use of documentation as integral to cultural heritage stewardship, treatment, and care decision-making Documentation workflows or standardization measures created in the workplace Plans for permanent record keeping of analog and digital documentation for future access How documentation is shared 		
	CONSERVATION	PRESERVATION	SCIENTIFIC ANALYSIS
	 Documentation of treatment, methodology, sampling or analysis locations Other 	Management of event- based collection care and conservation documentation (eg, emergency response documentation, capital project, reinstallation)	 Documentation of methodology, sampling or analysis locations Other

	Knowledge of emergency preparedness as it pertains to the storage	
	and security of critical documentation Policy or manual for collection	
	documentation management	
	Collection management system selection, implementation, and manual development	
	Creation of plans, strategies, or reports that reflect the importance of documentation in collection stewardship	
	Forecasts and advocacy of storage needs for data and documentation	
	Other	

COMPETENCY	
Health and Safety Policies and Regulations Being knowledgeable about workplace safety and practice and complying with federal, state, and local regulations, including determining when allied professionals should be contacted.	AIC Professional Members use this knowledge to ensure control measures for hazardous materials, identify appropriate safety equipment and operating procedures, and employ safe practices and hazard communication to reduce health and safety risks to humans and the environment.

RUBRIC		ALL PROFESSIONAL MEMBERS	6
Applicant's submissions demonstrate or include some of the following:	 Understanding the need, training, and testing required for using personal protective equipment; evidence of implementation Understanding of chemical safety procedures Adherence to lab safety standards and procedures Acting to inform and protect all staff, interns, volunteers, and users about/from health and safety risks inherent in their work Descriptions of health and safety procedures developed for the workplace Communicating any potential hazards in/on object materials or at the site to clients and custodians Completion of required and mandated safety training for all project participants, including students and trainees Understanding and proficient application of regulations for the storage and/or disposal of deaccessioned hazardous collection material as required Assessing the risk of interaction with cultural heritage against personal safety 		
	CONSERVATION	PRESERVATION	SCIENTIFIC ANALYSIS
	 Understanding of when it is not appropriate to use certain methods/materials due to potential hazards that may arise in the future Discussion of choice of treatment materials/methods based on health and safety issues Other 	 Understanding hazards and developing and applying risk mitigation, collection management, handling, and service policies Identification and communication of health and safety management needs as part of project management Other 	 Research on potential chemical and safety hazards in collections objects (or samples from collections objects or sites) coming into the lab for analysis Other

COMPETENCY	
Legal and Ethical Issues Respecting the integrity of cultural heritage, taking into account cultural context,	AIC Professional Members follow all laws applicable to their work and use the AIC Code of Ethics and Guidelines for Practice to guide them in developing and executing preservation, scientific, and conservation projects.

pertinent legal and ethical issues, and input from stakeholders. Adhering to the AIC Code of Ethics and Guidelines for Practice.			
RUBRIC	A	ALL PROFESSIONAL MEMBER	S
Applicant's submissions demonstrate or include some of the following:	 Knowledge of national and regional repatriation processes and laws regarding stolen artifacts Communicating and collaborating with stakeholders Consulting other professionals to see if any legal or ethical issues are applicable Understanding of cultural restrictions regarding the care of certain objects or sites Referring clients to other groups or individuals when the information sought is outside of one's purview (e.g. valuation, legal advice, capabilities, skills) Showing recognition and following of laws pertaining to the situation/ project Vetting specialists outside the field of cultural heritage preservation for appropriate skill sets and credentials 		
	AND/OR FROM APPROPRIATE COLUMN BELOW, AS APPLICABLE:CONSERVATIONPRESERVATIONSCIENTIFIC ANALYSIS		
	 Knowledge of the importance of maintaining documentation with cultural heritage Other 	 Knowledge, interpretation, and implementation of laws and ethical standards Knowledge of responsibility of governing body and staff to duty of care, duty of loyalty, and other legal standards in collection stewardship decision making Documentation management to support legal and ethical collection stewardship Policy and/or program development to support stewardship, including emergency preparedness, abandoned property, etc. Other 	 Procedures indicating how to enter, maintain, or archive accurate records of testing procedures or raw measurement data Discussion about collecting sample(s), optimal sampling site(s) Research questions based on literature review and critical assessment about the potential value of information gained versus extent of sampling Honesty about results and information gleaned from data measured Other

COMPETENCY			
Process of Change Understanding the changes that occur in cultural heritage over time.	AIC Professional Members recognize and understand that chemical, physical, technological, and biological processes, as well as use, deliberate change, or alteration by a hand other than that of the maker(s) can affect the conceptual and material aspects of cultural heritage. They use this knowledge to assess materials and conditions, manage the changes, determine when (or whether) to formulate actions, and select materials to preserve cultural heritage.		
RUBRIC	ALL PROFESSIONAL MEMBERS		
Applicant's submissions demonstrate or include some of the following:	 Understanding of mechanisms and/or types of deterioration in materials specific to area of expertise Understanding of the agents of deterioration, and their roles in contributing to and accelerating change Understanding of inherent vice Collaboration to develop risk mitigation strategies that address processes of change (see also Preventive Care) 		
	CONSERVATION	PRESERVATION	SCIENTIFIC ANALYSIS
	 Understanding when damage or modification may be of historical importance and add value to/offer insight into the history of cultural heritage Risk mitigation policies to prevent damage (see also Preventive Care rubrics) Other 	 Risk mitigation policies to prevent damage (see also Preventive Care rubrics) Other 	 Understanding of modes of chemical change Understanding and/or developing models of accelerated ageing Other

COMPETENCY			
Terminology and Communication Communicating technical, conceptual, and philosophical issues clearly and effectively.	AIC Professional Members communicate with cultural heritage stakeholders as part of collaboration, service, and advocacy. They translate cultural heritage terminology and philosophical precepts into language that allows those outside the field to understand their findings, observations, interpretations, interventions, and rationales.		
RUBRIC	ALL PROFESSIONAL MEMBERS		
Applicant's submissions demonstrate or include some of the following:	 Use of terminology in documentation that is consistent with that used in the field Use of inclusive and accessible language and information Interpretation and dissemination of specialized knowledge to various audiences Outreach initiatives through engagement with public about conservation and cultural heritage stewardship 		
	CONSERVATION	PRESERVATION	SCIENTIFIC ANALYSIS
	 Communicating and interpreting treatment options to a variety of project stakeholders Interpreting preservation risks and mitigation strategies in relation to legal compliance, ethical responsibility, and institutional reputation Other 	 Communicating and interpreting risks to collections and mitigation strategies for a variety of project stakeholders Other 	 Communicating and interpreting scientific analysis options, pros/cons of different methods, the general scientific principles of techniques, and the results of data Other

RUBRICS — PRACTICE COMPETENCIES

COMPETENCY	CONSERVATION	PRESERVATION	SCIENTIFIC ANALYSIS
Treatment Understanding that treatments achieve diverse structural, aesthetic, and functional goals for cultural heritage including preserving its values, prolonging its expected life, helping to promote better understanding of its intrinsic properties and meanings.	Conservators devise and carry out interventions guided by investigation, research, experience, and consultation with stakeholders. Conservation treatment may involve physical, chemical, or technological alteration of the work, while maintaining respect for the integrity of the work or site.	Preservation professionals work closely with conservators and analysts to ensure treatment strategies are consistent with broader preservation and collections care goals.	Analysts/scientists are aware of various treatment methods used historically and currently, and understand their effects on cultural heritage. Analysts/scientists work with conservators and preservation professionals to develop treatments, understanding the long-term impacts on the treated materials.
RUBRIC		ALL PROFESSIONAL MEMBER	s
Applicant's submissions demonstrate or include some of the following:	 Understanding of the role of conservation treatment in cultural heritage preservation Knowledge of how history and previous treatments may impact treatment, preservation and analytical decisions Understanding of the long-term impact of chosen methods/materials Understanding of and accommodation for possible risks to the object or site during treatment Consultation and/or collaboration with colleagues to better inform treatment decisions 		
	CONSERVATION	PRESERVATION	SCIENTIFIC ANALYSIS
	 Decision making rationale for treatment of cultural heritage given its historical context/structure/use Testing and/or mock-ups performed prior to choosing treatment method Research into potential methods and materials for treatment Design and execution of treatments that respect the material and history of 	 With supervision and training, and in specific settings, undertake tasks that limit risk or prevent further damage as part of a sustainable program of care Other 	 Collaborative projects to assess and test a material or technique Working with conservation staff to re-evaluate historic methods Description of how analytical methodology accounted for evidence of previous treatments Other

cultural heritage owner's/steward's needs and goals Discussing the rationale for treatment, including when not to treat at all	
Other	

COMPETER	ICY	CONSERVATION	PRESERVATION	SCIENTIFIC ANALYSIS
Preventive Formulating and implementing susta policies and recommendations slow, or monitor ch cultural heritage. T knowledge include understanding of a environmental and factors that can inf collections and site preservation.	Care ainable to prevent, nanges to his s l human luence	Conservators understand the approaches and methods used to prevent or mitigate the deterioration of works of cultural heritage. They employ risk assessment and mitigation to minimize deterioration and manage risks to cultural heritage.	Preservation professionals have an in-depth understanding of the approaches and methods used to prevent or mitigate the deterioration of works of cultural heritage in storage, on exhibit, in transit, or in use. They use this knowledge together with risk assessment and mitigation to develop and implement preventive care programs.	Analysts/scientists are familiar with techniques, equipment, and resources that can assist in managing environmental factors; and play a key role in researching, developing, and recommending methods and actions to protect cultural heritage from damaging situations.
RUBRIC	;		ALL PROFESSIONAL MEMBER	RS
Applicant's subm demonstrate or ir some of the follow	issions Include wing:	 Development of policies, procedures, or designs in support of preservation goals Promotion of preventive conservation approaches in project management Collaboration to ensure preservation of cultural heritage Knowledge of environmental impacts on the preservation of cultural heritage and how to mitigate these Knowledge of how to interpret and explain environmental data 		
		CONSERVATION	PRESERVATION	SCIENTIFIC ANALYSIS
		 Recognizing the balance between preventive and interventive measures Knowledge of advances in preventive methodologies 	Promoting collaborative preventive care programs as the most sustainable way to protect cultural heritage	 Contributing to or leading projects that augment the longevity of cultural heritage Research on how to understand and impede deterioration

 Risk mitigation policies to prevent or minimize damage Other 	 Recognition that emergency preparedness and resiliency are critical to stewardship Collaboration in implementing institutional plans that demonstrate responsibility to collection management policies, preservation policies, and duty of care Risk mitigation policies to prevent or minimize damage Other Showing how results from analysis influenced preservation protocols Development of methods for detecting, monitoring, quantifying, and/or reducing pollutants Other
---	--

COMPETENCY	CONSERVATION	PRESERVATION	SCIENTIFIC ANALYSIS
Scientific Principles and Examination Methods Understanding the structure, materials, and evidence of technology or creation of cultural heritage to characterize its current condition or state. Includes knowledge of scientific, analytical, and imaging techniques for identifying materials, determining changes in materials, measuring physical properties, and evaluating treatment options.	Conservators use appropriate tools and techniques to examine cultural heritage, and know how, and when, to employ analytical testing to obtain information relevant to technical investigation and preservation decisions. They understand when consultation with an analyst/scientist is necessary.	Preservation professionals maintain a generalized knowledge of the structure, materials, and evidence of technology or manufacture of cultural heritage to characterize its current condition or state. They maintain a working knowledge of scientific methods that influence preservation decisions and seek assistance from conservators and analysts/scientists as necessary.	Analysts/scientists understand scientific principles and how they apply to conservation, including how to access and use scientific literature and how to assess the validity of published research in conservation and allied fields. They employ scientific and analytical techniques for characterizing and identifying materials and/or determining changes in these materials and/or environments.
RUBRIC	ALL PROFESSIONAL MEMBERS		
	Collaboration with allied profession interpretation	essionals on the use of scientific a	nalysis, examination and data

Applicant's submissions demonstrate or include some of the following:	 General knowledge of various analytical methods and what types of information can be gleaned from each Critical evaluation and interpretation of data 		
	AND/OR FROM	APPROPRIATE COLUMN BELC	<i>)W, AS APPROPRIATE:</i>
	CONSERVATION	PRESERVATION	SCIENTIFIC ANALYSIS
	 Knowledge of how to characterize and/or identify materials by visual assessment Knowledge of how to identify evidence of aging, degradation, or corrosion Ability to identify materials used as part of previous interventions Testing, imaging, and/or analysis performed as part of examination or treatment Technical studies or reports Other 	 Ability to assess contract vendors to conduct analyses Consulting conservators, conservation scientists, or appropriate vendor for condition and/or treatment assessments Other 	 Technical reports and publications that demonstrate critical evaluation and interpretation of data Awareness that some analytical techniques and/or measurements will compromise cultural heritage Use of existing documentation and results from previous studies to inform new analyses Examination and analytical approaches that identify previous treatments, original or non-original materials Research that introduces new concepts and techniques to the field Other