Preserving Cultural Heritage

Peer Review in AIC Publications

AIC publishes various types of publications, including periodicals, conference proceedings, occasional books, website articles, and wiki-based documents. Some documents originated in print and have become digital while others are born-digital and continue to evolve. The content of each publication has different levels of review to ensure accuracy. Due to their complex nature, some publications like the AIC Wiki have more than one type of peer review.

Here are four basic types of peer review, listed from most stringent to least, with some information about how we categorize each publication's content.

1. Academic Review

Example - Journal: Double-blind peer review; author and reviewer names are hidden from each other. Reviewed by editor and subject area associate editor before each submission is given to two or three peer reviewers who are experts in different aspects of the publication, such as conservator and conservation scientist. This volunteer work is done as a service to the author and the profession, ensuring all published pieces are as good as they can be. The process is difficult, but the goal is to help authors communicate their findings and experience in the clearest way possible.

a. Journal of the American Institute for Conservation (JAIC)

2. Committee Review

Example - Abstracts: Program committee selects topic; one single-blind peer review may be performed. The committee changes annually or per project. Some editing by committee may be performed in collaboration with the author(s).

- a. AIC Wiki*
- b. Conference Proceedings: Postprints, Abstracts, and Posters*
- c. Books
- d. White papers/position papers

3. Editorial Review

Example - Newsletter: Review by a predetermined group of professionals who are involved in the production of the publication. Article reviewed by editor and possibly sent to external experts for comment; staff members proofread/copy edit. One single-blind peer review may be performed.

- a. Member newsletter AIC News
- b. AIC Wiki*
- c. Conservation OnLine
- d. Conference Proceedings: Postprints*

- e. Resource Hub
- f. STASHc
- g. Survey Reports

4. Community Review

Example - Wiki: Review by a community of professionals who vet and review; wikis typically edited recurringly by readers and reviewers, not at time of publication.

- a. AIC Wiki*
- b. AIC Blog
- * Some content on these platforms has different levels of peer review, depending on individual editorial structure or source material.

Created by the Publications Subcommittee of the Communications Committee, March 2021: Rachael Arenstein, Lisa Goldberg, Abed Haddad, Julio del Hoyo-Meléndez, Bonnie Naugle, Laura Resch, Rebecca Rushfield, Erin Stephenson, Morgan Wylder